Replication in Parapsychology: The Correlation Matrix Method

ABSTRACT:

Background
Theorists have suggested that decline effects and the apparent elusiveness of psi may be overcome by employing an experimental method that permits anomalous correlations to emerge. The Correlation Matrix Method (CMM) has been developed to test these ideas using a micro-PK task. Previous CMM studies have reported positive findings, though employing an analysis method that has some weaknesses.

Aim
We aimed to validate and replicate CMM studies, including more robust analysis and assessing a new method of generating control data (using permutated experimental data), which was compared with the previous studies’ method of using control sessions.

Method
The work consisted of one software validation study, and three CMM replication studies. All studies were completed as planned, with variations on some exploratory study hypotheses as agreed with the wider CMM Consortium project to which this work contributes (PI Walach; Bial ref. 400/14).

Results
The first CMM replication study (105 participants, 200 sessions) obtained significant results supporting the CMM hypothesis. This study also demonstrated that it was statistically valid to employ the permutated experimental data as control data, implying that control sessions are not needed. CMM Replication Studies 2 and 3 (each with 100 participants and 205 sessions) therefore used the permutation method without control sessions. Contrary to expectation, both studies obtained overall results that did not support the primary CMM hypothesis and therefore did not replicate earlier positive findings. However, in both studies effects were observed in the direction opposite to that predicted. It seems unlikely that this consistent reversal is simply due to chance, however as this was a post hoc finding and there are other uncontrolled procedural variations between the studies, any explanation can only be suggestive at this stage.

Conclusions
Our first replication study validates the original CMM claims using improved analytical methods. However, CMM is still a young and developing paradigm and we recommend that future studies systematically evaluate the role of the control data and of other theoretically relevant experimental variables.

Keywords
Theory, Replication, Entanglement correlations, Correlation Matrix Method, Micro-PK

**Published Work:**


**Researcher’s Contacts:**

Professor Caroline Watt  
School of Philosophy, Psychology and Language Sciences  
University of Edinburgh  
7 George Square  
Edinburgh EH8 9JZ.  
Telephone: +44 131 650 3382  
Email: Caroline.Watt@ed.ac.uk

Ana Flores  
School of Philosophy, Psychology and Language Sciences  
University of Edinburgh  
7 George Square  
Edinburgh EH8 9JZ.  
Email: Ana.Flores@ed.ac.uk ; anabrflores@gmail.com